

PREHOSPITAL AND DISASTER MEDICINE
VOLUME 17/SUPPLEMENT 3

HEALTH DISASTER MANAGEMENT GUIDELINES FOR EVALUATION AND RESEARCH IN THE UTSTEIN STYLE



VOLUME I. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK OF DISASTERS

Task Force on Quality Control of Disaster Management



The World Association for Disaster and Emergency Medicine



The Nordic Society for Disaster Medicine

EDITORS

Knut Ole Sundnes, MD

Professor Marvin L. Birnbaum, MD, PhD

COLLABORATING ORGANIZATIONS

Mediterranean Council for Burns and Fire Disasters

Nordic International Rescue Foundation

Organization of African Unity

Swedish National Board on Health and Welfare

United Nations Department of Humanitarian Affairs

World Health Organization

© 2003 Prehospital and Disaster Medicine

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced or transmitted
in any form or by any means, electronic or mechanical, including
photocopy, recording or any information storage
or retrieval system, without permission from the publisher

ISBN: 1049-023X

Editors: Knut Ole Sundnes, MD; Marvin L. Birnbaum, MD, PhD; Elaine Daily Birnbaum, RN, BS, FCCM
Designer: Kathie Campbell

Printed in USA

This work was supported in part by grants from the Laerdal Foundation for Acute Medicine; the Royal Norwegian Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the Swedish National Board on Health and Welfare; the Swedish International Development Agency (SIDA); Joint Medical Command Norwegian Defence Forces and the Nordic Council.

Steering Committee

Knut Ole Sundnes, MD, Norway, Chairman
Jacov Adler, MD, Israel
Professor Marvin L. Birnbaum, MD, PhD, USA
Professor Johan Calltorp, PhD, Sweden
Professor S. William A. Gunn, MD, Switzerland
Dr. Omar J. Khatib, MD, Organization of African Unity
Professor Michele Masellis, MD, Italy
Ernesto A. Pretto, MD, MPH, USA
Robert Souria, United Nations Department of Humanitarian Affairs, Switzerland
Takashi Ukai, MD, Japan

Gothenburg Congress Delegates

Jacov Adler	Leo Klein	Kalwole Raheem
Richard Alderslade	Mark A. Klyachko	Abdul Radjak
Wahid Al Kharusi	Joachim Kreysler	Edmund Ricci
Bishara Atiyeh	Jeffrey Levitt	Leonid Roshal
John Barrett	Kristian Lexow	Margareta Rubin
Marvin Birnbaum	Alessandro Loretto	Debarati Guha Sapir
Richard Bissell	Gudjón Magnússon	Knut Ole Sundnes
Fredrick M. Burkle Jr.	Michele Masellis	Elena Tivadze
José da Cruz	Matti Matilla	Naruo Uehara
Albert K. Ekue	Eric Noji	Karl Axel Wallman
Jean Marie Fonrouge	Karl-Axel Norberg	Harsh Wardhan
S. William A. Gunn	Idris Nur	Yukihito Wato
Brian Gushalak	Chief Segun Olusola	Jürgen Weyland
Jennifer Jaumotte	Pierre Perin	Klaus Wiersing
Omar J. Khatib	Jean Luc Poncelet	Dawit Zawde
	Ernesto Pretto	

Lyon Congress Delegates

Jacov Adler	Leo Klein	Claire Pirotte
Diego Buriot	Mark A. Klyachko	Jean Luc Poncelet
Fredrick M. Burkle, Jr.	Joachim Kreysler	Abiel Hamid Saïdi
Elaine Daily-Birnbaum	Tore Laerdal	Edita Stok
Marvin Birnbaum	Jeffrey Levitt	Knut Ole Sundnes
Judith M. Fisher	Alessandro Loretto	Abdul Radjak
Jean Marie Fonrouge	Matti Matilla	Leonid Roshal
Andre Griekspoor	K. Joanne McGlown	Margareta Rubin
Omar J. Khatib	Marielu Portet	Elena Tivadze

Correspondence

KO Sundnes, MD, Department of Anaesthesia, 1306 Baerum P.T. Norway
e-mail: knut.sundnes@sanr.mil.no

ML Birnbaum, MD, PhD, University of Wisconsin-Madison
3330 University Avenue, Madison, WI 53705 USA
e-mail: mlb@medicine.wisc.edu

Key Words: analysis; catastrophe; data collection; definitions; description of disaster; disaster; disaster management; disaster medicine; disaster phases; disaster research; disaster responses; extrication; health consequences; health status; injuries; interventions; measures of effectiveness; medical responses; morbidity; mortality; preparedness; needs assessment; public health; research; research design; research methods; risk evaluation; scope; template; type; Utstein style; warning

ACKNOWLEDGEMENT

We express our profound gratitude to Elaine Daily-Birnbaum whose critical questions, editorial skills, and linguistic abilities were significant in making this document what it has become.

We also are deeply in debt to Kathie Campbell who unselfishly devoted her time and professional skills to convert our manuscript into this book.

Without these two ladies, we still would have had a long way to go.

Knut Ole Sundnes
Marvin L. Birnbaum

FOREWORD



DURING THE PAST 20 years, natural disasters have killed at least 3 million people, and have affected 800 million more. Since 1990, 6 million have died as a direct result of armed conflicts around the world. Disasters don't only affect health directly through violence and trauma. The effect on the national social and economic infrastructure decreases access to education and damages the public health system.

Disaster preparedness and mitigation make a difference. Health systems and communities are better prepared to cope. Preparedness minimises excess morbidity and reduces damage when disasters happen. In complex emergencies, there are well-known and cost-effective public health measures that can save lives.

The basis for any successful public health intervention is sound health information. Research and evaluation provide health practitioners with the knowledge needed for preparedness and response. Standardised methods and definitions are necessary so that results of research and evaluation are valid and comparable. This book makes a valuable contribution to address this need.

Research and evaluation also provide good platforms to exchange knowledge. As humanitarian crises become more complex, with new and varied actors on the ground, strong partnerships and collaboration between organisations, experts, and disciplines is vital to build capacity.

It is for these reasons that the World Health Organization supports efforts to promote systematic approaches to evaluation and applied research in emergencies to strengthen the evidence base for disaster reduction from a public health perspective. This book provides important guidelines for those who are seeking methods for a better understanding of the impact of disasters on societies and people everywhere.

Dr. Gro Harlem Brundtland
Director-General
World Health Organization

HEALTH DISASTER MANAGEMENT
Guidelines for Evaluation and Research in the Utstein Style

PREFACE



THIS IS THE FIRST OF four volumes to be published initially as Supplements to *Prehospital and Disaster Medicine* and eventually as a bound, free-standing, four volume set. These *Guidelines* and the Templates embedded within them are the result of more than seven years of discussions by members of the Steering Committee of the Task Force for Quality Control of Disaster Management and of two Congresses with participants from more than 40 countries. They are designed to provide the structure for the conduct of research and evaluations into disasters.

The current volume provides a discussion of a Conceptual Framework that forms the organization necessary for developing an understanding of the pathophysiology of disasters. Volume II contains a description of 14 basic societal functions that may be affected by an event producing a disaster. All of the basic societal functions are interactive and their respective functions are integrated by a Coordination and Control function. Volume III partitions the flow of disasters into Phases that are functional and not temporal. These Phases are linked together in a Disaster Response Template. Each of the Phases is described in detail and two severity scores (Disaster Severity Score and Health Disaster Severity Score) are introduced that will facilitate comparison of disasters caused by similar and dys-similar events. Volume IV provides a road map for the design and conduct of research or evaluations. It includes two additional templates that outline the steps in a research or evaluation project and the steps involved in the design of such projects.

The current Volume outlines the need for the structure encompassed in the *Guidelines*, and it seeks to establish a common nomenclature and a set of definitions essential for communication between the elements that comprise Disaster Medicine, as well as between Disaster Medicine and each of the other disciplines involved in Disaster Management. A comprehensive Glossary of Terms is included. Much of the confusion in discussions of disasters is related to the lack of a universally accepted set of definitions. Each discipline has its own set of definitions often for the same or similar terms. Disasters

require interactions by many disciplines, some seemingly far distant from Disaster Medicine.

Chapters One and Two examine the human and economic scope of disasters. Together, they establish the need for structure in the performance and reporting of disaster research and for the evaluations of interventions for preparedness and for responses to events.

Chapter Three provides a set of definitions, some of which are new to the Science. Examples include the absorbing and buffering capacity of a given society to an event caused by the actualization of a specific hazard. The Chapter presents a logical framework into which each of terms fit. Using this structure, it seeks to clarify some of the terms whose definitions may differ between the many disciplines involved in disaster planning and response. Hopefully, use of this structured approach will help to clarify the confusion created by use of the same term in the many contexts in which it is applied.

Chapter Four identifies many of the factors that contribute to the probability that damage will occur from an event, given that an event is the actualization of a hazard. It uses a mathematically designed expression to relate hazards, risks, preparedness for, and responses to an event.

Chapter Five describes methods for defining the level of damage that results from an event, its impact on the functional status of the components of the affected society, and for identification of the needs that result from the damage. It uses the production process model and relates functions with requirements, consumption, and needs. Supplies are described in terms of available resources both human and material as goods and services. Societal functions and subfunctions have thresholds below which the supplies of goods and/or services are unable to provide all of their required functions. In addition, some functions, such as the available supply of potable water, also have a critical threshold below which the available level of supplies cannot support the lives of the affected population, manifest by a rise in the crude mortality rate. The need for appropriate indicators of function of levels of available supplies is developed.

Chapter Six examines analyses of interventions in terms of their effects, outcomes, benefits, and costs. It introduces a new concept, Best Outcome Without Intervention (BOWA) that may be helpful conceptually in determining the impact of an intervention or set of interventions.

Chapter Seven examines responses to an event highlighting the need for well-defined goals and objectives without which it is not possible to define

the effectiveness of the response. Further, it examines the relationships between indicators, their thresholds, and the development of standards. Recovery is defined as is management as the process taken to minimize the damage and restore the pre-event status of the society impacted by an event.

Lastly, in this Volume, some of the ethical dilemmas associated with disasters and their relations to international law are discussed. The issues raised are meant to provoke discussion and are not proposed as definitive solutions to all of the dilemmas associated with disasters and their management.

All together, the Conceptual Framework should stimulate the development of a common language that will promote the understanding of the pathophysiology of disasters. To this end, a Glossary of Terms also is provided that expands on the work pioneered by SWA Gunn in the first attempt to gain understanding through standardization of the language and concepts we use in describing the events that comprise the greatest threats to humankind. It is not intended to be the definitive and final work, but should remain a dynamic document. It should form the basis for reporting of all future research and evaluations into all aspects of disaster medicine. Without using such a structure, it will be difficult to relegate hazards to a state that they no longer pose a massive threat to us and our children. We look forwards to your responses and input.

Knut Ole Sundnes, MD

Professor Marv Birnbaum, MD, PhD

TABLE OF CONTENTS



Foreword	v
Preface	vii
List of Figures	xiv
List of Tables	xv
Acronyms and Abbreviations	xvi

VOLUME I

I. Introduction

<i>Chapter One</i> Introduction	1
<i>Chapter Two</i> Current Methods Used for Evaluation and Research ...	25

II. Conceptual Framework

<i>Chapter Three</i> Overview and Concepts	31
<i>Chapter Four</i> Conceptual Model	56
<i>Chapter Five</i> Functional Status, Thresholds, Indicators, Damage, Requirements, Supplies, and Needs	69
<i>Chapter Six</i> Interventions, Outcomes, Benefits, and Costs	103
<i>Chapter Seven</i> Responses, Relief, and Recovery	113
<i>Chapter Eight</i> Ethical Issues	128

(The following sections will be published in future issues)

VOLUME II

III. Basic Functional Components of a Society

Overview of Basic Societal Functions	
Description of the Basic Societal Functions	
Public Health	
Medical Care	
Water and Sanitation	
Shelter and Clothing	
Food	
Energy Supplies	
Search and Rescue	
Public Works and Engineering	
The Environment	
Logistics and Transport	
Security	
Communications	
Economy	
Education	
Co-ordination and Control	

VOLUME III

IV. Research and the Templates

- Current Methods Used for Evaluations and Research
- Overview of the Disaster Evaluation-Research Templates

V. The Disaster Response Template

- Overview of the Disaster Response Template
- Phase 1. Pre-Event Status of the Population Affected
- Phase 2. The Event
- Phase 3. Damage
- Phase 4. Health Disaster
- Phase 5. Needs Assessments
- Phase 6. Responses
- Phase 7. Changes in Health Status
- Phase 8. Restored Health Status

VOLUME IV

VI. Guidelines and Template for the Conduct of Evaluation-Research

- Introduction to Evaluation Research
- Introduction to the Template for Evaluation-Research
- Designing Evaluation Research
- Disaster Evaluation-Research Template

VII. Summary, Conclusions, and Recommendations

- Summary and Conclusions
- Recommendations

Glossary of Terms 144

Index 168

LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 —Table of Research	20
Figure 3.1 —Diagrammatic representation of definitions	35
Figure 3.2 —Graphical representation of the time course of sudden-, gradual-, and slow-onset events	41
Figure 3.3 —Flow chart illustrating some of the pathways for damage related to a destructive event	46
Figure 3.4 —Relationship between vulnerability and resilience	49
Figure 3.5 —Relationship between damage and the absorbing capacity of the society	50
Figure 3.6 — Buffering capacity of a function in two different societies	52
Figure 4.1 —Relationship between productive disaster response and total vulnerability	64
Figure 4.2 —Schematic depicting the probability damage (P_D) as a function of the risk	65
Figure 5.1 —A production process	71
Figure 5.2 —Complex production processes	72
Figure 5.3 —Relationships between consumption and supply	73
Figure 5.4 —Supply inadequate to maintain the functional or pre-event state	74
Figure 5.5 —Relationship between damage needs of five segments of the affected population	76
Figure 5.6 —Threshold as an all-or-none relationship	78
Figure 5.7 —Possible relationships between the level of available supplies and function	79
Figure 5.8 —Relationship between level of water supply and function	81
Figure 5.9 —Conceptual method for identifying thresholds	83
Figure 5.10 —Schematic depicting cause-effect relationships of one resource on multiple functions	84
Figure 5.11 —Hypothetical model illustrating relationship between function and critical threshold of supply	88
Figure 5.12 —Plot of supplies vs functional and critical thresholds on consecutive assessments	90
Figure 5.13 —Plot of supplies on Days 1, 4, 10, and 30 following a sudden onset event	91
Figure 5.14 —Theoretical model depicting the impact of two events of different magnitudes on a given society	94

Figure 5.15 —Severity scores vs survival for patients with ischaemic heart disease before and after ACLS training	96
Figure 6.1 —The transformation process	104
Figure 6.2 —The transformation process as related to disasters	107
Figure 6.3 —The effects of a recovery from an acute event in two societies	108
Figure 6.4 —Diagrammatic representation of cost-efficiency, cost-effectiveness, and cost-benefit	111
Figure 7.1 —Example of different indicators for food supply or nutritional status	119

LIST OF TABLES

Table 1.1 —Numbers of natural disasters, persons affected and killed for all natural disasters from 1951-2000	4
Table 1.2 —Numbers of persons affected and killed by natural disasters from 1966–1990 and from 1991–2001	5
Table 1.3 —Numbers of technological disasters, persons affected and killed for all technological disasters from 1951-2000	7
Table 1.4 —Available economic costs for all natural disasters from 1951–2000 ...	10
Table 1.5 —Available economic costs for all technological disasters from 1951-2000	10
Table 1.6 —Number of disasters and reported costs of disasters from 1966–1990 and from 1991–2000	11
Table 3.1 —Classification of known hazards	36
Table 3.2 —Relationships between a precipitating event (absence of rain) and outcome (crude mortality rate)	41
Table 3.3 —Differences in the definitions between types of onset and the duration of an event	42

ACRONYMS AND ABBREVIATIONS

BATNA	Best Alternative to Negotiated Agreement
BOWA	Best Alternative To Negotiated agreement
CRED	Center for Research on Epidemiology on Disaster
CRID	Regional Disaster Information Center
CSP	Center for Systemic Peace
DCCP	Disaster Critical Control Point
DHA	Department of Humanitarian Affairs
DMTP	Disaster Management Training program
FCDP	Force Commander's Policy Directive
HR	United Nations Declaration of Human Rights
ICHI	Independent Commission on International Humanitarian Issues
ICRC	International Committee of Red Cross
IDNDR	International Decade for Natural Disaster Reduction
IDP	Internally Displaced People
IGO	Inter-Governmental Organization
IHL	International Humanitarian Law
IOMC	Inter-Organization Program for the Sound Management of Chemicals
IPCC	Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change
ISDR	International strategy for Disaster Reduction
NATO	North Atlantic Treaty Organization
NCDC	National Climatic Data Center
NGO	Non-Governmental Organization
OAU	Organization of African Unity
OCHA	(UN) Office for Coordination of Humanitarian Affairs
OFDA	Office of Foreign Disaster Assistance
PAHO	Pan-American Health Organization
PDM	Prehospital and Disaster Medicine
RoE	Rules of Engagement
SIPRI	Stockholm International Peace Research Institute
SOP	Standard Operational Procedure
UDPC	Uppsala University Department for Peace and Conflict Research
UATI	International Union of ytechnical Associations and Organizations
UK	United Kingdom
UNDRO	United Nations Disaster Relief Coordinating Office
UNFCCC	United Nations Framework Con vention on Climate Change
UNOG	United Nations Office in Geneva
US	United States (of America)
WADEM	World Association for Disaster and Emergency Medicine
WFEQ	World Federation of Engineering Organization
WHO	World Health Organization
WMA	World Medical Association